

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X  
MARIA PENA,

Plaintiff,

-against-

CITY OF NEW YORK, et al.,

Defendants.  
-----X

HERRERA, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

CITY OF NEW YORK, et al.,

Defendants.  
-----X

A P P E A R A N C E S:

Derek Sells  
The Cochran Firm  
233 Broadway, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10279  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Pena*

Alan M. Shapey  
Lipsig, Shapey, Manus & Moverman P.C.  
40 Fulton Street, 25<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10038  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs Herrera et al.*

Alan H. Scheiner  
Brian K. Morgan  
The City of New York Law Department  
Office of Corporation Counsel  
100 Church Street  
New York, New York 10007  
*Attorneys for Defendants City of New York,  
Thomas Deprisco, Roy Richter, Ricky Karpen,  
Brian White, Michael Zarilli, David Gaskin*

Discovery Order  
CV-02-3147 (NG) (JMA)

Discovery Order  
CV-02-3163 (NG) (JMA)

*Vincent Fiorenza & Peter Moy*

Howard Hogan  
Mary Jo White  
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP  
919 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
*Attorneys for Defendant PBA*

George L. Repetti  
John Aloysius Beyrer  
Mulholland, Minion and Roe  
374 Hillside Avenue  
Williston Park, New York 11596  
*Attorneys for Defendant Joseph Grey*

Bruno Vincent Gioffre, Jr.  
Andrew C. Quinn  
Quinn Ferrante & Mellea, LLP  
399 Knollwood Road, Suite 220  
White Plains, New York 10603  
*Attorneys for Defendants Keith Singer  
& Dennis Healy*

Gregory M. Longworth  
John W. Burns  
Worth, Longworth & London  
111 John Street, Suite 640  
New York, New York 11038  
*Attorneys for Defendants Jack Conway,  
Michael Immett, Michael Gaudio,  
Anthony Prinzano, Edward Sills,  
Marie Desario, Paul Alba, John Chavez,  
John Gallo, Michael McGill, Patrick Lynch,  
Martin Finkelstein & John Welsh*

Howard Finkelstein  
Law Offices of Howard Finkelstein  
364 North Avenue  
New Rochelle, New York 10801  
*Attorney for Defendant Wild Wild West Inc.*

AZRACK, United States Magistrate Judge:

On February 24, 2006, as the result of an *in camera* review of the Internal Affairs Bureau and the Civilian Complaint Review Board printouts, I ordered defendant City of New York to produce all corresponding files and documents associated with six incidents to defense counsel for defendants Finkelstein, Immitt, and Gallo and to submit them to this Court for a further *in camera* review. None of the other incidents listed on the printouts nor the files associated with them were ordered for production. The six files submitted to the Court for *in camera* review included both documents and audiotapes. After a complete and thorough review of all the records and tapes, I do not deem any of the information contained therein to be relevant to the present suit. Therefore, I grant the City's request to withhold both the IAB and CCRB printouts from production, as well as all documents and records corresponding with the incidents on the IAB and CCRB printouts.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: Brooklyn, New York  
April 26, 2006

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
JOAN M. AZRACK  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE